

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION
OF OREGON**

LC 73

In the Matter of

PORTLAND GENERAL ELECTRIC
COMPANY,

2019 Integrated Resource Plan.

RULING

DISPOSITION OBJECTION WITHDRAWN; SIGNATORY PAGE FOR HENRY
TILGHMAN ACCEPTED

On May 23, 2019, the presiding ALJ granted Portland General Electric Company's (PGE) request for a general protective order to govern the acquisition and use of protected information produced or used in these proceedings. On June 6, 2019, the Northwest and Intermountain Power Producers Coalition (NIPPC) filed signatory pages under General Protective Order No. 19-186. NIPPC sought to qualify several persons under paragraph 12, which allows for counsel for a party and any persons employed directly by counsel of record. NIPPC also sought to qualify Mr. Tilghman under paragraph 13, which is for other persons, and is the option a party uses to qualify any consultants.

On June 13, 2019, PGE filed an objection to the designation of Mr. Tilghman as a qualified person. PGE stated that Mr. Tilghman and his consulting company, Tilghman Associates, at times represent industrial customers, electricity service suppliers (ESS), and independent power producers; some of whom are PGE's competitors in the wholesale electric market.

PGE explained that it considers some of the information that may be disclosed as extremely commercially sensitive information that would provide Mr. Tilghman's clients (potential competitors of PGE) an unfair advantage over PGE and its customers. PGE noted its hourly price forecast data as an example. PGE noted at that time that it was working with NIPPC's counsel in an attempt to resolve the objection. On June 21, 2019, PGE filed what it referred to as a modified objection to NIPPC's request to designate Mr. Tilghman as a qualified consultant. The request, made on behalf of both PGE and NIPPC, asked for the following, certain modifications specific to Mr. Tilghman:

1. PGE withdraws its objection to Mr. Tilghman signing the Protective Order.
2. Mr. Tilghman will not seek, and Staff will not grant Mr. Tilghman access to the Commission's Huddle site. Mr. Tilghman will not access the Huddle site for purposes of this docket.
3. NIPPC's counsel will provide Mr. Tilghman non-confidential documents in this docket.
4. PGE will provide Mr. Tilghman access to confidential information under Order No. 19-186, subject to PGE's right to object to Mr. Tilghman seeing specific documents and imposing special handling conditions for document; for example, giving Mr. Tilghman access to review specific documents only at PGE's offices.

PGE requested that the Commission approve the modified terms above to provide Mr. Tilghman's access to PGE documents under Order 19-186. No stakeholders filed a response to PGE's motion.

Per the parties' request, we find that PGE's objection to Mr. Tilghman's signature is withdrawn, and Mr. Tilghman's signature page is allowed to go into effect so that he is a qualified person under General Protective Order No. 19-186. We have confirmed with Commission Staff that Mr. Tilghman does not have Huddle access. We also accept the parties' fourth point, that PGE will provide Mr. Tilghman access to confidential information under Order No. 19-186, subject to special handling conditions as needed, such as giving Mr. Tilghman access to review specific documents only at PGE's offices. This ruling accepts PGE's proposal for special treatment of Mr. Tilghman under the General Protective Order No. 19-186.

A party may appeal this ruling to the Commission under OAR 860-001-0110.

Dated this 28th day of June, 2019, at Salem, Oregon.



Christopher J. Allwein
Administrative Law Judge



Sarah Rowe
Administrative Law Judge